BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10631463 6

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

S.M. Makuch

VOLUME II

1982-1983

with the assistance of

Gary Yee

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

LAW LIBRARY

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

S.M. Makuch

VOLUME II

1982-1983

with the assistance of

Gary Yee

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/municipalplannin02maku_5

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

Table of Contents

PART II

CHAPTER V

INTRODUCTION TO PLANNING

Introduction 412

A. The Origins and Theory of Planning 413

J. Jacobs, "The Death and Life of Great American Cities" 413

Note 417

W.I. Goodman, et., "Principles and Practice of Urban Planning" 418

Note 425

Greenspan & Vaughan, "How the Zoning Game is Played: A Look at Land Use Procedures" 425

S. Proudfoot, "Private Wants and Public Needs: The Regulation of Land Use in the Metropolitan Toronto Area" 437

B. The Municipal Role in Planning and The Official Plan 429

(i) Introduction 429

Ontario Economic Council, "Subject to Approval" 429

Note 433

(ii) The Official Plan and Conformity 433

Note 433

Re Cadillac Development Corporation and City of Toronto 434

Holmes et al. v. Regional Municipality of Halton 438

Notes and Questions 439

(iii) The Limits of Official Plans 440

Re Official Plan of Richmond Hill Planning Area 440

Re Borough of Scarborough and the Minister of Housing for Ontario 441

(iv) Metropolitan or Regional Official Plans 446

Note 446

Campeau Corporation v. Township of Gloucester 446

C. The Provincial Role in Planning 450

Note 450

White, "Ontario's Land Use Legislation" 450

Note 454

Union Gas Ltd. v. Corporation of Dawn 454

CHAPTER VI

THE PRIVATE CONTROL OF LAND USES

Introduction 458

A. Restrictive Covenants 459

Tulk v. Moxhay 459

London County Council v. Allen 460

Stilwell v. Blackman 465

Shepherd Homes Ltd. v. Sandham 465

Earl of Leicester v. Wells U.D.C. 465

Wrothan Park Estate v. Parkside Homes 465

One Twenty-Five Varsity Road Ltd. v. Twp. of York 466

Note 469

Re Sekretov and City of Toronto 470

Re Hart et al. and Harrietsfield-Grand Lake Community Association 474

B. Building Schemes 477

Hyett, "Restrictive Covenants: An Appraisal of Building Schemes" 477

Megarry & Wade, The Law of Real Property 479

Scharf v. Mac's Milk Ltd. 483

MacGregor et al. v. Boyd Builders Ltd. et al. 485

Re Lorne Park 489

Re Zierler 490

Shen Investments Ltd. v. Mosca 490

Texaco Antilles Ltd. v. Kernochan 491

C. Modification of Restrictive Covenants 492

Note 492

Re Beardmore 492

Re Beardsley's Application 494

D. Nuisance 495

Walker v. McKinnon Industries 495

Cairns v. Canada Regining & Smelting Co. 499

Gertsen v. Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 501

Spur Industries Inc. v. Del E. Webb Dev. Co. 504

Bottom v. Ontario Leaf Tobacco Co. Ltd. 507

CHAPTER VII

ZONING AND LAND USE CONTROL

Introduction 510

A. Introduction to Zoning 511

Makuch, "Zoning: Avenues of Reform" 511

Note 512

B. The Scope of The Zoning Power 513

Note 513

(i) Exclusionary Zoning and the Scope of the Zoning Power 513

Village of Euclid v. Ambler Realty Co. 513

Note 518

R. v. Brown Camps Ltd. 519

Notes and Questions 523

City of Barrie v. Brown Camps Residential and Day Schools 524

Notes and Questions 529

R. v. Bell (Div. Ct.) 530

R. v. Bell (O.C.A.) 533

R. v. Bell (S.C.C.) 540

Notes and Questions 546

Notes 548

Current Dilemmas and Legal Issues in "Housing For All Under Law" 549

Notes and Questions 555

C. Discrimination and Zoning 556

Note 556

City of Toronto v. Mandelbaum 556

Note 558

Scarborough Township v. Bondi 558

Notes and Questions 561

H. G. Winton v. Corporation of the Borough of North York 562

Re Twp. of North York Restricted By-Law 566

City of Ottawa v. Royal Trust Co. 569

B.P. Canada et al. v. City of Brampton 570

D. Bad Faith 571

Note 571

Re Cadillac Development Corp. and City of Toronto 571

Re Wall & Redekop Corp. Ltd. and City of Vancouver 575

Notes and Questions 578

City of Halifax v. Hollet et al. 578

H. G. Winton v. Corporation of the Borough of North York 583

Hauff et al. v. City of Vancouver 584

E. The Administration of Zoning By-Laws 587

Polai v. City of Toronto 587

Notes and Questions 589

F. Prohibiting All Uses 589

R. v. Gibson ex parte Cromiller 589

Corporation of the City of Coquitlam v. Karamanolis 590

G. Planning and Land Value 592

Note 592

Romanica v. Greater Winnipeg Water District 592

Belfast Corporation v. O.D. Cars Ltd. 596

Note 602

Regina Auto Court v. City of Regina 602

Re Simpson and City of Vancouver 604

Rodenbush v. Corporation of the District of North Cowichan 609

Notes 611

H. Negligence 612

Note 612

Dorschell v. City of Cambridge 612

Barratt v. District of North Vancouver 614

Nielsen v. City of Kamloops et al. 617

Welbridge Holdings Ltd. v. Metropolitan Corporation of Greater Winnipeg 620

Bowen et al. v. City of Edmonton (No. 2) 624

Inland Feeders v. Virdi 630

CHAPTER VIII

ZONING REFORMS AND DEVELOPMENT CONTROL

Introduction 636

A. Limitations on Zoning 637

Note 637

Re Mississauga Golf and Country Club 637

Notes and Questions 640

Re O'Donnell and City of Belleville 640

Notes 642

Town of Uxbridge v. Timber Brothers Sand and Gravel Ltd. 642

Note 644

Note 645

Makuch, "Zoning: Avenues of Reform" 645

B. Reform of Zoning 650

Note 650

Soo Mill & Lumber Co. Ltd. v. City of Sault Ste. Marie 651

Sanbay Developments Ltd. v. City of London 655

Notes and Questions 658

Note 659

Re Cogan et al. and City of Toronto et al. 659

Papolis v. Corporation of the Borough of Scarborough 660

Note 662

Re Walmar Investments and City of North Bay 669

Re Sorokalit & Mississauga 670

C. Section 35a of The Planning Act 675

Canadian Institute of Public Real Estate Companies et al. v. Corporation of the City of Toronto (Div. Ct.) 675

Canadian Institute of Public Real Estate Companies et al. v. Corporation of the City of Toronto (S.C.C.) 680

Notes and Questions 683

240953 Developments Ltd. et al. v. Corporation of the City of Hamilton 684

Note 685

Re City of Toronto By-Law 234/75 685

City of Toronto Planning Board Report 688

Note 690

"Not at a Council's Whim", The Globe & Mail 690

Notes 691

D. Section 45 of The Planning Act 692

Note 692

A. W. Banfield Construction Ltd. v. City of Oshawa 692

Note 694

E. Lot Levies 695

Hudec, "Municipal Exactions and the Subdivision Approval Process: A Legal and Economic Analysis" 695

Note 703

Re Mills and Land Division Committee of York 704

Notes and Questions 707

Re Steel Co. of Canada and City of Nanticoke 707

Pinetree Development Co. Ltd. v. Minister of Housing for Ontario 712

Re Frey and Regional Municipality of Peel Land Division Committee 717

Western Peat Moss Ltd. v. Twp. of Sandwich South 720

Re Glenworth Homes 721

CHAPTER IX

PRE-EXISTING RIGHTS OF LANDOWNERS

THE RIGHT TO A BUILDING PERMIT

Introduction 724

A. Ontario 725

(i) The Basic Rule 725

Note 725

City of Ottawa v. Boyd Builders 726

Note 731

(ii) A Pre-existing Intent 732

Note 732

Re Overcomers Church and City of Toronto 732

Notes 737

Note 738

R. v. City of Barrie, ex parte Bernick 738

Notes and Questions 742

Re Donald Bye Excavating Co. Ltd. et al and City of Peterborough 742

(iii) Good Faith 745

Note 745

Re Cambridge Leaseholds and City of Toronto (No. 2) 745

Note 749

	Hall v. City of Toronto and Hadley	750
(iv)	Proceeding with Dispatch	756
	Rethazy et al. v. Corporation of the Town of Lincoln	756
	Note	759
	Re 261532 Development Corp. Ltd. and City of Toronto	759
(v)	The Application Itself	760
	Note	760
	Re David Gallo Building Co. Ltd. and City of Toronto	760
(vi)	Other Jurisdictions	764
	Note	764
	(i) Nova Scotia	764
	Re Governors of Dalhousie College & University and City of Halifax	764
	Chater v. City of Dartmouth	765
	(ii) British Columbia	765
	Monarch Holdings Ltd. v. Oak Bay	765

CHAPTER X

CONTINUING RIGHTS OF LANDOWNERS

NON-CONFORMING USES

Introduction		770
Note		771
(i)	Defining the Use	771
	Central Jewish Institute v. Toronto	771
	Note	775
	Regina v. Rutherford's Dairy Ltd.	775
	Note	777

(ii) Extension or Enlargement of Buildings 778

Re Wilmot and Kingston 778

Notes 783

(iii) Changing Uses 783

R. ex rel. Skimmings v. Cappy 783

(iv) Abandonment of Uses 785

Gayford v. Kolodziej et al. 785

O'Sullivan Funeral Home Ltd. v. Corporation of the City of Sault Ste Marie 786

Notes 787

(v) Amortization of Uses 788

Note 788

City of Los Angeles v. Gage 788

Note 791

(vi) Other Jurisdictions 791

Note 791

CHAPTER XI

PROCESS REQUIREMENTS AND THE MUNICIPALITY

Introduction 792

A. Access to Information 793

Makuch, Jackson, "Freedom of Information in Local Government in Ontario" 793

Notes 801

B. Right to a Hearing 802

Note 802

(i)	Municipal Councils, Police Commissions, and Boards of Education	802
	Atkinson et al. v. The Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto	802
	Notes	805
	Campeau v. Calgary	805
	Notes	811
	Re Zadrevec and Town of Brampton	811
	Re Maple Leaf Mills and Point Edward	816
	Questions	818
(ii)	Planning Boards	819
	Note	819
	Re Florence Nightingale Home and Scarborough Planning Board	819
	Re Cummer-Yonge Investments Ltd. and A. G. Ontario et al.	822
	Starr v. Township of Puslinch et al.	825
	Note	829
(iii)	Minister's Orders	829
	Re Orangeville Highlands and A. G. Ontario	829
	Notes	832
(iv)	Subdivision Agreements	833
	Re Maurice Rollins Construction Ltd. and Township of South Fredericksburg	833
	Homex Realty and Dev. Co. Ltd. v. Village of Wyoming	833
(v)	Committees of Adjustment and Land Division Committees	835
	Note	835
(vi)	Nature of the Hearing Required	836
	Re McMartin et al. v. City of Vancouver	836
	Re Bourque	841
	Notes	842

(vii) The Ontario Municipal Board 843

Notes 843

CHAPTER XII

ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW OF MUNICIPAL ACTION

Introduction 846

Note 847

A. The Jurisdiction of the Ontario Municipal Board 847

Re Township of North York Restricted By-Law 847

Kuchma v. Rural Municipality of Tache 849

Notes 849

Re Merrens et al. and Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 850

B. The Ontario Municipal Board as Policy Maker - The Board's View 853

Note 853

(i) Member's Values 853

Re Vaughan Planning Area Official Plan Amendment 853

Note 856

(ii) Government Policy 856

Re Township of Caledon Official Plan 856

Notes and Questions 859

(iii) Good Planning Principles 860

Re Lord Nelson Hotel 860

Note 863

(iv) Financial & Economic Concerns 863

Re East York By-law 7633 863

Re Etobicoke By-law 14508 865

Note 869

(v) Land Value and Planning 869

Re McGregor and Scarborough 870

Forum: "The Role of the Professions in the Future Environment" in 1974 Law Society of Upper Canada Special Lectures 873

Notes and Questions 874

(vi) Minority Rights 874

Re Toronto Restricted Area By-law 348-73 874

Notes 880

Jowell, "The Limits of the Public Hearing as a Tool of Urban Planning" 883

C. The Ontario Municipal Board as Policy Maker - The Court's View 891

Notes 891

Re Cloverdale Shopping Centre Ltd. and Township of Etobicoke 891

Notes 898

Re Hopedale Developments Ltd. and Town of Oakville 899

Notes 903

Re Township of Innisfil and Township of Vespra et al. (Ont. C.A.) 904

Re Township of Innisfil and Township of Vespra (S.C.C.) 915

Notes 916

D. Petitions to Cabinet 917

Notes 917

Statement by the Prime Minister of Ontario re the Spadina Expressway 917

Offman Holdings Ltd. v. A. G. Ontario 921

E. Who Should Make Planning Decisions? 925

Tollefson v. Township of Gloucester 925

Notes 926

"Forum: The Role of the Professions in the Future Environment" 927